## International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice Vol.1, No.4 December 2024



e-ISSN: 3047-1362; p-ISSN: 3047-1370, Pages 37-59

DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.62951/ijlcj.v1i4.242">https://doi.org/10.62951/ijlcj.v1i4.242</a>
Available online at: <a href="https://international.appihi.or.id/index.php/IJLCI">https://international.appihi.or.id/index.php/IJLCI</a>

## Implementation of Full Systematic Land Registration Policy (Study in Bunut District, Pelalawan Regency)

## Priyo Budi Maryoso

Master of Public Administration, Universitas Terbuka, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Abstract Implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) in Bunut District is one of the biggest PTSL activity targets at the Pelalawan Regency Land Office for the 2021 fiscal year, namely 7,964 Land Rights Certificates (SHAT), however the realization achieved was only 3,728 Certificates (K1). Because of this, the research is intended to examine how Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activities are implemented in Bunut District and what factors hinder the Implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activities in Bunut District. The theoretical concept used is the Policy Implementation Theory according to the Theory of George C. Edward III. This research uses a qualitative method with descriptive data analysis. Data collection techniques are carried out using interviews, observation and documentation. Data analysis techniques with stages of data collection, data reduction, data display and confirmation of conclusions. The research results show that the implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activities in Bunut District is in accordance with Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) based on Minister of ATR/Head of BPN Regulation No. 6 of 2018 concerning PTSL and there are several obstacles in its implementation including: Lack of human resources at the Pelalawan Regency Land Office, lack of enthusiasm regarding the imposition of BPHTB, the existence of plots of land that enter or intersect with PIPPIB areas and forest areas, the imposition of PTSL preparation costs, land owners who are not available or cannot be contacted.

Keywords: Registration, Land, Systematic

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Land registration, known in the community as land titling, is a government obligation to provide certainty and legal legality of proof of community land ownership. Together with business assistance, land certificates can be used as effective and productive capital to improve the welfare of the community. Indonesia has 126 million parcels that require certification. Of the total 126 million land parcels in Indonesia, only about 47 million have been registered through the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) program, the remaining 79 million parcels are still the target of land registration activities for the government (National Land Agency). Land parcel registration targets in the Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJM) activities include 5,000,000 parcels in 2017, 7,000,000 parcels in 2018, 9,000,000 parcels in 2019, and 10,000,000 parcels per year for the period 2020-2025, with coverage of all land areas in Indonesia.

In the land parcel registration system, there are two methods that can be used, namely, Systematic land registration is a first-time land registration activity that is carried out simultaneously and covers all unregistered land objects in an area or part of an area in a particular village/kelurahan and sporadic land registration is the process of registering land for the first time on one or several land objects in a certain area, either individually or in groups. This process is carried out based on requests from related parties. Registration of land parcels

with a systematic method is a process of land parcel registration stages that are mass and massive in nature and cover a certain area to provide legal legality so that in its implementation it needs to be supported by an Adjudication Committee specifically formed by the Head of the Land Office, so that the main activities in the land office are not interrupted. Registration of land parcels using this systematic method is carried out according to work projections and is carried out in regions to be determined by the Minister of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning. When an area has not yet been designated as the location of a village/sub-district for registration of land parcels using the systematic method, the activities are carried out through land registration using the sporadic method.

So far, the community has chosen sporadic land registration activities because the community sees that systematic land registration has not been organized thoroughly in each village every year by the government. When using a sporadic land registration system, land registration is limited to the number of applications submitted by the community, so that the land parcels measured can be scattered according to existing juridical data. In addition, this process did not include improving the quality of registration data for previously registered land. The slow process of issuing land certificates has been a major focus of attention for the Government. To address this problem, the Government, through the Ministry of ATR/BPN, has initiated a National Priority Program in the form of acceleration in Complete Systematic Land Registration, which aims to find effective and efficient ways of land registration and improve the quality of land registration data in Indonesia. It is hoped that the target of 79 million registered land parcels can be completed by 2025 based on complete systematic land registration (PTSL).

According to the Regulation of the Minister of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/Head of the National Land Agency of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 of 2018, it is explained that Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) is a land registration activity carried out simultaneously for the first time on all land objects throughout the territory of the Republic of Indonesia, in one village or kelurahan, or equivalent. This activity includes the collection of physical data and other data related to one or several land objects required for the registration process. This Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activity is intended for all Indonesian citizens, especially for groups that have a weak economy. The Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activity also serves as a means for the Land Office to form a complete picture of a village and become the basis for managing administration and updating an accurate and reliable land database.

Regarding the costs that are the obligation of the landowner, it is in accordance with

the Joint Decree of the Minister of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/Head of the National Land Agency, Minister of Home Affairs, and Minister of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration known as SKB 3 Minister of 2017 (Number: 25/SKB/V/2017, Number: 590-3167A of 2017, and Number: 34 of 2017) regulates the financing of the preparation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL). In this SKB, one of the provisions in the ninth dictum is that if the cost of systematic land registration preparation is not budgeted in the Regional Budget (APBD), then the Minister of Home Affairs instructs the regent/mayor to make a regulation stipulating that the cost will be borne by the community. This means that if a region does not allocate a budget for PTSL activities, then the community in that region will be charged a fee to support the implementation of land registration.

The Complete Systematic Land Registration Program is financed by the APBN of the Ministry of ATR/BPN, but there are activities that are not covered by the APBN, such as document preparation, procurement of boundary stakes, stamps, and the operation of village officials. These costs can be budgeted through the Regency / City APBD or charged to the community in accordance with Regent regulations. Pelalawan Regency in the context of uniformity of PTSL preparation costs based on the SKB 3 Ministers in accordance with dictum 9, has stipulated Pelalawan Regent Regulation number 23 of 2020 concerning financing of preparatory activities for complete systematic land registration in Pelalawan Regency. The Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) program in Pelalawan Regency is carried out by the Pelalawan Regency Land Office which is under the authority and directly responsible to the Minister through the Head of the Riau Province Land Agency Regional Office. The Pelalawan District Land Office has a target of 31,786 land rights certificates (SHAT) in 2021 for people who have not registered their land.

The implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) of Pelalawan Regency in 2021 was carried out in 6 (six) sub-districts, namely Bunut Sub-district, Bandar Petalangan Sub-district, Pangkalan Kuras Sub-district, eluk Meranti Sub-district, Pelalawan Sub-district and Kuala Kampar Sub-district with a total target of 31,786 certificates of land rights (SHAT), but the realization achieved was 11,687 certificates. Bunut sub-district was chosen as the research location because it is one of the biggest targets of PTSL activities, namely 7,964 certificates of land rights (SHAT), but the realization achieved was only 3,728 certificates. In addition, Bunut Sub-district is geographically passed by a cross road to the Ombak Bono tourist attraction, which according to the author, the value of land in the Bunut Sub-district area will increase along with the increased development of road infrastructure and other infrastructure to support these tourist attractions by the Pelalawan Regency Government.

Pelalawan Regency Land Office has 33 Civil Servants as Human Resources (HR) led by One Head of Office, Six Supervisory Officers, Fifteen Coordinators and Eleven Analysts or Staff and assisted by PPNPN (Non Government Employees) totaling 27 people and 3 ASK (Assistant Cadastral Surveyors) with the duties and functions of assisting work in the Land Office. The number of Human Resources (HR) in the Pelalawan Regency Land Office is not in accordance with the amount of work in the Land Office, this is because the existing HR in addition to being assigned to provide routine daily services at the Land Office, these HR are also required to be involved in completing National Strategic Program (PSN) activities such as Complete Systematic Land Registration activities, Land Redistribution of Agrarian Land Reform Objects (TORA), whose target fields reach tens of thousands of fields each year.

#### 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

#### **Implementation Concept**

According to Purwanto & Sulistyastuti (2012: 21), policy implementation is a series of stages aimed at delivering policy outputs to target groups. This process is carried out by implementers, who act as a link between policy formulation and policy realization in the field. Explained by Winarno (2002: 101-102), a group of people chosen to carry out a series of tasks to get planned results is called implementation. According to Solichin (1990: 51), policy implementation can be interpreted as the stages carried out in people, representatives, or organizations from the public or private sector with the intention of heading in the direction specified in the finalization of the policy.

#### **Policy Implementation Concept**

Public policy implementation is defined by Van Meter and Van Horn (Winarno, 2008: 146-147) as actions taken in response to previous choices. To achieve predetermined goals, this activity involves ongoing efforts to make significant and minor adjustments in accordance with policy decisions made by public agencies, as well as actions to create results into easy activities within a certain period of time. As stated in the book Solihin Abdul Wahab (2008: 65), Daniel A. Mazmanian and Paul Sabatier (1979) define implementation as understanding what actually happens after a program is considered effective or formulated. This is the focus of policy implementation, specifically the events, activities and events that occur after the enactment of policy guidelines. From this description, it can be concluded that before the determination or identification of goals and objectives through policy decisions, policy implementation will not begin. Thus, implementation is a series of actions taken by various actors that, in the end, produce results consistent with the intentions and objectives of the

policy.

## The Concept of Public Policy

The study of public policy spans disciplines and domains, including economic, political, social, cultural, legal, and so on. The hierarchy of public policy, which includes laws, government regulations, presidential and ministerial regulations, regional and provincial government regulations, governor decrees, district/city regulations, and regent/mayor decrees, further indicates that public policy can be national, regional, or local. Public policy, according to Laswell and Kaplan (1970: 71), is also a projected program of values, goals, and practices, or a program to achieve certain values, goals, and behaviors. Public policy, according to Pressman and Widavsky (Winarno 2002: 17), is a conclusion that includes predictable initial conditions and outcomes. It is important to distinguish public policy from other types of policy, such as private policy. The involvement of non-governmental factors has an impact on this. Based on his definition of public policy, Thomas R. Dye (cited by Islamy 2009: 19) states it is "whatever the government chooses to do or not to do." His explanation highlights that public policy is not just a declaration of the will of the government or public officials, but rather focuses on the implementation of "action".

## **Concept of Complete Systematic Land Registration**

In accordance with Government Regulation No. 10 of 1961 or Government Regulation No. 24 of 1997 (Article 1 point 9 of Government Regulation No. 24 of 1997), land registration for the first time is an activity by the government on unregistered land parcels. The first time land registration was carried out was systematic and sporadic land registration. According to Article 1 point 10 of Government Regulation No. 24 of 1997, systematic land registration is a land registration activity that is carried out for the first time simultaneously and covers all land registration objects that have not been registered in the area or part of the area of a village or sub-district. Article 1 of the Regulation of the Minister of ATR / BPN Number 6 of 2018 concerning Complete Systematic Land Registration, Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) is a Government activity carried out jointly on all Land Registration objects throughout the territory of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia in one kelurahan, one kecamatan, or other equivalent names. This activity includes collecting and determining the accuracy of physical and legal data regarding one or more Land Registration objects for registration purposes.

#### Frame of mind

According to the Regulation of the Minister of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/Head of the National Land Agency of the Republic of Indonesia Number 6 of 2018, it is explained that

Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) is the implementation of recording for the first time land parcels and is carried out simultaneously for all land registration objects throughout the territory of the Republic of Indonesia in one village or other name at the same level. This activity includes collecting physical data and information on one or more land registration objects for registration purposes. With the implementation of the Systematic Land Registration policy in all areas of the Republic of Indonesia, the implementation of land registration becomes easier, faster and can provide a guarantee of legal legality with the recognition of land certificates for the people. The implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration by the Pelalawan District Land Office in 2021, one of which is determined in Bunut District and based on Table 1.3. (Target and Realization of PTSL Sertipati Pelalawan Regency Fiscal Year) above, it is known that Bunut District is one of the biggest targets for PTSL activities, namely 7,964 certificates of land rights (SHAT), but the realization achieved is only 3,728 certificates.

#### RESEARCH METHOD

## Research Design

This research uses qualitative descriptive research methods. According to Djam'an Satori (2011: 23), qualitative research is conducted because researchers want to investigate descriptive phenomena that are not measurable, such as the steps involved in a work step, recipe formulas, the meaning of various concepts, attributes of a product or service, images, styles, cultural practices, models of tangible artifacts, and so on. According to the information provided by the various experts mentioned above, descriptive qualitative research is a set of procedures used to collect data in its natural state, free from specific manipulation, with an emphasis on meaning. As this research examines the phenomena that emerged during the implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration activities in Banut District, the researcher used a descriptive qualitative research methodology. In addition, this research is inductive, and the results emphasize meaning.

#### Data source

This research uses primary and secondary data sources, as follows:

- a. Primary data
- b. This information was collected directly from respondents who answered a questionnaire on the challenges faced in the implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration activities in Bunut District.
- c. Secondary Data

This information was obtained from supporting data such as, Technical guidelines for the

implementation of complete systematic land registration (PTSL) Number 1/juknis-100.HK.02.01/2021, Pelalawan Regent Regulation Number 23/2020 concerning the size of the PTSL preparation fee.

## Aspects to be Researched

According to Poerwandari (2007) asserts that the researcher is the most crucial instrument in qualitative research methods. However, in this case, the researcher needs the following technology to make data collection easier:

## a. Recording Equipment

The purpose of the recording equipment is to help the process of repeating the results of the interview and help researchers ask back to the respondent if there is less data

#### b. Interview Guidelines

Used as a researcher's guide regarding the aspects that must be asked as well as a checklist whether these aspects have been completed or there is more to ask. The aspects that serve as guidelines in the interview are as follows:

- 1) What is the mechanism for implementing the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activity in Bunut Sub-district?
- 2) How was information conveyed to residents about the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activity in Bunut Sub-district?
- 3) What is the level of community enthusiasm after the enactment of Pelalawan Regent Regulation No. 23/2020 on Financing activities to prepare for complete systematic land registration in Pelalawan District?
- 4) What other factors hinder the implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activities in Bunut Sub-district?

## **Data Analysis Technique**

This research is descriptive research, with more descriptions of the results of interviews and documentation studies. The data that has been obtained will be analyzed qualitatively and described in descriptive form. The method of data analysis techniques used in this study based on the suggested procedure includes:

- a. Data Collection
- b. Data Reduction
- c. Data Display
- d. Verification and Affirmation of Conclusions (Conclution Drawing and Verification)

#### 4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

## Implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) Policy in Bunut Sub-district

The implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) Program in Bunut Sub-district, Pelalawan Regency is in accordance with the technical guidelines on Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) Number 1/Juknis-100.Hk.02.01/I/2021 dated 4 January 2021 including:

## Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activities at the Pelalawan district land office in the 2021 fiscal year are divided into 2 (two) activities, namely:

- 1) PTSL ASN, namely the first land data collection for fields that have not been measured, mapped and titled
- 2) SHAT PTSL, namely land registration for land parcels that have been measured and mapped both through the K3 Product of the PTSLi Program in 2017 and 2018 which have been mapped previously and through the PTSL PM product k3 in 2019 and 2020 by the Licensed Survey Services Office (KJSKB) which involves the community through the land data collection group (PULDATAN) for boundary designation and data collection. There are 8 (eight) villages in Kecamatan Bunut, namely PangkalaniBunut Village, Merbau Village, Lubuk Emas Village, Sungai Buluh Village, Baganilaguh Village, Balamimerah Village, Farmer Village and Lubuk Mandian Gajah Village that are included in the PTSL-PM SHAT activities in 2021, where the land parcels have been measured and mapped by the Licensed Survey Services Office (KJSKB) Maskur et al, so that at the PTSL planning stage a proposal was included for the determination of the location of SHAT PTSL for the 2021 budget year because it is very possible to become a complete sub-district in 2021.

## PTSL Location Determination based on the 2021 technical guidelines, is carried out:

- 1) Location of villages/sub-districts with a relatively low number of registered land parcels.
- 2) Priority villages/sub-districts whose area has been mapped to be the location of PTSL 2021 (K3 Products in 2017 and 2018, as well as K3.1 and K3.3 Products in 2019 and 2020).
- 3) Village/Kelurahan locations that will be designated as PTSL 2021 locations and are expected to be implemented the following year adjacent to the Village/Kelurahan in this year's location.

In the Location Determination implementation stage, the Head of the Measurement and Mapping Section and its members prepare the Basic Map of Registration per Village / Subdistrict which overlays / overlays the potential distribution of untitled land parcels with the Forest Area Map based on SK 903 / Menlhk / Secretary General /la.2 /12/2016, village

administration boundary maps, New Permit Termination Maps and improvements to Primary Natural Forest and Peatland Management (PIPPIB) according to Presidential Instruction Number 5 of 2019 and other maps so that safe land parcels can be obtained and are outside the Forest area and PIPPIB area along with other information to be used as material for the PTSL location determination meeting as well as a Working Map for both the Physical Team and the Adjudication Juridical Team.

Researcher analysis of the implementation of location determination activities is in accordance with existing provisions, one of which is by considering PTSL PM activities in the previous year which in fact have not been titled, such as in Bunut District, which is used as a location determination village for the issuance of certificates. Based on Edward II Theory, the Bureaucratic Structure Variable in the form of mechanism aspects has been carried out in accordance with the Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR / BPN No. 6 of 2018. Pelalawan District Land Office in determining the location of the Village / Village Determination of PTSL Activities based on the agreement of the meeting results during planning activities.

## Preparation

In the Preparation Stage before the implementation of SHAT PTSL PM activities in Bunut sub-district, the Head of the Land Office made preparations:

- 1) Facilities and infrastructure for implementation Activities that need to be prepared before the implementation of SHAT PTSL PM activities in Bunut District, namely:
  - a) Working Map resulting from the overlay between the distribution of potential untitled land parcels and the Forest Area Map based on SK 903/Menlhk/Setjen/Pla.2/12/2016, village administration boundary map, New Permit Termination Map and improvement of Primary Natural Forest and Peatland Management (PIPPIB) according to Presidential Instruction No. 5 of 2019 and other maps.
  - b) Land parcel maps and a list of Recapitulation of the names of landowner subjects resulting from measurements and mapping by the Maskur et al Licensed Survey Service Office (KJSKB) in the previous year, which became a reference for the adjudication team to inventory and identify PTSL objects and subjects in Bunut Subdistrict.
  - c) Procurement of a blank list of juridical data research minutes (DI 201), application form, Sporadic physical statement letter.
- 2) Human Resources, preparing human resources at the Land Office according to their expertise to be formed into several Adjudication Committee Teams in order to complete

- the field target in accordance with the specified time.
- 3) Prepare operational vehicles, basecamp locations in the village, handheld GPS including computers, printers and paper for the Adjudication Team 5 members.
- 4) Coordinate with the Bunut sub-district head and village heads in Bunut sub-district regarding the implementation mechanism including the involvement of land data collectors (PULDATAN) who were formed in the previous year when assisting the measurement and mapping activities of the Office of Licensed Surveyors (KJSKB) Maskur, et al.

## Formation and Determination of the PTSL Adjudication Committee

After determining the location of the Village/Kelurahan for the SHAT PTSL PM activity in Bunut District, as well as preparation and coordination with the Village Head/Head of Village, the Head of the Office held a Meeting with the Supervisory Officials and members to form and determine the personnel who will be involved in the Adjudication Team, both Civil Servants (PNS), PPNPN (Non-Civil Servant Government Employees), Honorary Workers including the Cleaning Service. In accordance with the position and authority based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN No. 6 of 2018. The Physical Task Force was not formed for the SHAT PTSL PM Activity in Bunut District because the measurement and mapping activities to produce a land area map and a subject recapitulation table had been carried out by a third party, namely the mapping of the Licensed Survey Service Office (KJSKB) Maskur, et al. The results of the Meeting decided to form 5 adjudication teams along with a legal task force, a physical task force and an administrative task force where the Supervisory Officials were trusted and given responsibility as the Head of Adjudication. Formation and Determination of 5 Adjudication Teams by the Head of the Pelalawan Regency Land Office in accordance with the Decree of the Head of the Pelalawan Regency Land Office Number. 42/SK 14.05.UP.02.01/II/2021 dated February 1, 2021 concerning the composition of the Adjudication Committee for the Physical Task Force, Legal Task Force and Administrative Task Force for Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) of Pelalawan Regency in 2021. As for the SHAT PTSL PM activity task force in Bunut District, the Head of the Pelalawan Regency Land Office formed 5 Adjudication Teams along with the Legal Task Force and Administrative Task Force.

The Administration Task Force is tasked with assisting in recording and managing the needs of facilities and infrastructure during PTSL activities. The researcher's analysis of the activities of the Formation and Determination of the PTSL Adjudication Committee has been in accordance with existing provisions and the formation of the Adjudication Committee has

also accommodated the previous year's PTSL activities, namely by forming the SHAT PTSL PM Adjudication Committee in Bunut District. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Disposition Variable has been well implemented by the Pelalawan Regency Land Office in carrying out the disposition of the Implementation of the Policy of the Minister of ATR/BPN Regulation No. 6 of 2018 to form and determine the Adjudication Committee.

## Counseling

The SHAT PTSL-PM Extension Activity in Bunut District was carried out by TEAM 5 SHAT PTSL-PM in several sub-district/village locations or centrally at the Bunut sub-district office for several villages and led by the Head of the Pelalawan Regency Land Office involving the Head of Bunut Sub-district, Mrs. Srinursari, SE, Village Heads/Village Heads, Bhabinkantibmas, Babinsa and the entire community in determining the location of the Sub-district/Village for the 2021 SHAT PTSL-PM activity. The SHAT PTSL-PM Extension Activity also involved members of the Land Data Collection Officers (PULDATAN) who were involved in the measurement stage by a third party by the KJSKB Maskur Licensed Survey Services Office. Counseling is carried out by providing an explanation regarding:

- 1) Procedure for implementing SHAT PTSL-PM
- 2) Obligation to install and determine boundary markers
- 3) Documents and forms that must be completed
- 4) Costs that are covered and not covered such as stamp duty
- 5) BPHTB tax
- 6) Benefits of Certificates for Rights holders

The counseling that was carried out was also conveyed to the PULDATAN to be able to assist the activities of both the Adjudication Committee Team and the landowner community to complete the documents. The counseling activities carried out in Bunut District are in line with the statement during the interview by the Deputy Chairperson of Jurisdiction, Mr. Ahmad Luthfi, that the PTSL counseling activities are very important before further activities are carried out, so that the community and PULDATAN understand and know that this year the Bunut District in several villages/sub-districts PTSL PM in 2020 will be followed up with community land certificate activities.

The researcher's analysis of the extension activities or socialization of PTSL activities was in accordance with the provisions even though the participants who attended did not include all land owners to be certified because the domicile concerned was outside the Bunut District and so could not be contacted. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Bureaucratic Structure Variable which includes the Mechanism aspect has been carried out well by the Adjudication

Committee and has been carried out according to the SOP (Standard Operational Procedure), however, the Communication variable in the form of the Information Transformation dimension (transmission) of extension from the Adjudication Committee was not followed up by the Village Apparatus to convey the information to residents who were not present.

## **Collection of Physical Data Legal Data**

The implementation of SHAT PTSL PM in Bunut District in the 2021 budget year was carried out without any measurement and mapping activities, because the determination of the location of SHAT PTSL PM activities in 8 (eight) villages/sub-districts had previously carried out these activities which were carried out by a third party Licensed Survey Services Office (KJSKB Maskur, et al.). Based on the statement from Mr. Ahmad Luthfi as Deputy Chairperson of Juridical during the interview, it was conveyed "that the legal data collection activity assisted by Puldatan was because they were involved in last year's activities and knew the position of the object including the subject of the land owner, Identification and collection of legal data were carried out door to door per RT or community initiatives that delivered their documents to the village office". The Researcher's Analysis based on the physical data collection activity and legal data was in accordance with the regulations even though for the implementation of physical data collection in Bunut District, measurements and mapping were no longer carried out considering that the activity had been carried out by the third party KJSKB Maskur et al. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Bureaucratic Structure Variable which includes the Mechanism aspect has been carried out well by the Adjudication Committee because it has been carried out according to the SOP (Standard Operational Procedure), that the requirements for the completeness of the subjects and objects carried out by the Adjudication Committee are based on Technical Instructions Number 1 / Technical Instructions-100.Hk.02.01 / 2021 dated January 4, 2021.

#### **Legal Data Research for Proof of Rights**

Based on the Legal Data that has been collected by the legal task force assisted by Puldatan related to the application files in accordance with the existing requirements, the Adjudication Committee conducts Legal Data Research to prove Rights, namely:

- 1) Checking the completeness of the application files
- 2) Conducting research and assessments regarding land conditions, land history and proof of the existence of a legal relationship between the object and the land owner subject;
- 3) Conducting field research related to land control including its boundaries;
- 4) Examining the suitability of the requested land area with the existing work map;
- 5) Providing opinions, input and conclusions regarding whether or not the land area can be
- 8 International Journal of Law, Crime and Justice Volume 1, No. 4, December 2024

granted rights.

The conclusion of the results of the review or research of legal data for the granting of rights by the Adjudication Committee is stated in the Legal Data Research Minutes. This is in line with what was conveyed by the results of the interview with Mr. Yudi as a Member of the Legal Task Force that the Legal Data Research Activity is carried out by the Adjudication Committee including the Village Head/Village Head on land plots that have been equipped with documents, the Adjudication Committee will determine whether or not the land plot can be certified after the Adjudication Committee meeting is held including considering input from land boundaries".

The Researcher's Analysis based on the Legal Data Research activity for Proof of Rights has been carried out by the Adjudication Committee including the Village Head as a member of the Adjudication Committee although the results of this Research concluded that many K3.1 Clusters could not be upgraded to K1 (Certificate) because there were problems with the land plots, one of which was the Forest Area. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Bureaucratic Structure Variable which includes the Mechanism aspect has been carried out well by the Adjudication Committee and has been carried out in accordance with the SOP (Standard Operational Procedure).

## Announcement of Physical Data and Legal Data on Land and its Approval

Team 5 of the Adjudication Committee in Bunut District followed up on the results of the Land History study and the map of the results of the identification of measurement objects and third party clarification mapping by KJSKB Maskur et al., by announcing physical data and legal data in 8 (eight) villages/sub-districts where the SHAT PTSL PM activity was determined. The announcement contained physical data in the form of a Land Area Map from a third party containing the coordinates of the object's location, land boundaries, land area, field identification number and also contained legal data in the form of NIB, Land Area Map Number, area of PTSL participant names. The announcement was made for 14 calendar days as a basis for publicity by the adjudication committee in proving land ownership as stated in DI (List of Contents) 201B. The announcement was made by posting it in strategic places such as in the Village/Sub-district Office, Mosque/House of Worship and also through the Land Office's social media.

Within the announcement period of 14 calendar days, if the landowner submits an objection or rebuttal regarding the subject and object of his land plot, the person concerned can provide a written objection to the Pelalawan Regency Land Office using the list of objections/objections to the announcement of the results of the physical and legal data research

(DI 309) after the period ends and then after the completion of the 14 calendar days, the ratification of the announcement of the physical and legal data is carried out as stated in List of Contents 202. The statement was supported by Mr. Jefri Trisno Tambunan, as Deputy Chairperson of Physics that "within 14 days of the announcement, if the landowner submits an objection/rebuttal to his land plot, either in terms of area or boundaries, the third party's clarification map will be proposed for revision of the map by the measurement section". A similar statement was also conveyed by Mr. Syamsurizal, as a member of the legal task force That the community is expected to be able to ensure the name and date of birth in the legal data so that there are no errors in typing the name and date of birth on the certificate and submit objections through DI 309 if there are problems, either conflicts or disputes regarding the requested land plot".

The researcher's analysis of one of the activities of the Announcement of Physical Data and Legal Data of the land plot and its Approval has been carried out in accordance with the provisions by posting announcements in the village office and at the PTSL activity post, both land objects in the form of land plot maps and also a summary of the names of prospective land owners. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Bureaucratic Structure Variable which includes the Mechanism aspect has been carried out well by the Adjudication Committee, has been carried out according to the SOP (Standard Operational Procedure) and also the Disposition Variable of understanding the regulations has also been carried out by the Adjudication Committee related to the announcement period, if there are objections/objections, the Adjudication Committee will not issue the certificate according to the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN No. 6 years 2018.

#### **Clustering of PTSL Activities**

After the final conclusion is obtained and then the Approval is signed by the Head of the PTSL SHAT Adjudication Committee Team 5, the Adjudication Committee divides or clusters the land plots into several clusters, namely:

- 1) Cluster 1 (K1) for land plots whose physical data and legal data meet the requirements for issuing a Land Rights Certificate (SHAT) both HM/HGB/Use Rights
- 2) Cluster 2 (K2) for land plots whose physical data and legal data meet the requirements for issuing a Certificate but there are cases in court or disputes.
- 3) Cluster 3 (K3), includes: Cluster K3.1, the PTSL activity stages have been carried out up to the announcement but cannot be recorded including issuing a certificate, because: The land owner is not willing to make a statement of BPHTB and/or PPh debt; The land object is located in the Indicative Map for Termination of New Permit Issuance (PIPPIB) area.

Cluster K3.2, the PTSL activity stages have been carried out up to the announcement but cannot be recorded and a certificate issued, because the P3MB object, Class II State House that has not been paid off for rent, Nationalization object or subject is a foreigner, private legal entity. Cluster K3.3, PTSL Products whose implementation is only carried out up to the physical data collection stage, because: there is no SHAT budget in the current budget year the landowner is willing to show the boundaries but is not yet willing for the land to be certified.

4) Cluster 4 (K4), land areas whose objects and subjects have been registered and have certificates but have not been mapped.

## **Bookkeeping and Issuance of Land Title Certificates**

All land plots clustered into Cluster 1 (K1) will be recorded and issued a Land Rights Certificate. In the process of recording Land Rights (HM/HGB/Use Rights or Waqf Land Rights) are recorded in the land register and recorded in the land book. Issuance of Certificates is carried out by providing a rights number then printing the Land Rights Certificate is carried out through the KKP Application including Printing Land Books. The certificate can be followed up to become K1 if the land area has been resolved and the lack of files including the statement of objections related to BPHTB tax have been completed, by:

- 1) The location of the land is in the Village/Sub-district that is determined as the location of PTSL in the following year;
- 2) If the village/sub-district is no longer determined as the location of PTSL, then the settlement and financing are carried out using the Routine/PNBP service mechanism.

The statement is in accordance with what was conveyed by Mr. Yudi as a Member of the Juridical Task Force that "for Cluster K3.1, it can be followed up to become K1, if the location/village is determined to be the PTSL location in the following year or through the Routine route, namely through the counter at the Land Office through PNBP/personal financing". Researcher's analysis based on the Bookkeeping & Issuance of Land Title Certificates is carried out by being recorded in the land register and recorded in the land book. Issuance of Certificates is carried out by providing a title number then printing the Land Title Certificate is carried out through the KKP Application. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Communication Variable in the form of the information consistency dimension has been carried out well systematically, because the results of SK 310 regarding the name of the subject and the position of the object have been consistently issued with Certificates and Land Books.

#### **Certificate Submission**

The handover of Land Title Certificate products for the SHAT PTSL PM Activity in

Bunut District for the 2021 Fiscal Year has been carried out directly to landowners in stages, both collectively in several villages at the Bunut Village soccer field and at each Village Office. The simultaneous handover of Certificates for 5 (five) villages, namely Bunut Village. Lubuk Emas Village, BalamiMerah Village, Merbau Village and LubukiMandian Gajah Village was carried out on Saturday, July 9, 2022, for 2,230 plots of land at the Astaka Soccer Field in Bunut Village by the Regent of Pelalawan accompanied by the Head of the Pelalawan Regency Land Office. After the Simultaneous Handover Ceremony was carried out in several villages, the Handover of Certificates to 3 (three) other villages was continued in stages, namely Bagan Laguh Village, Sungai Buluh Village and Petani Village. The certificate is handed over directly to the land owner by showing his/her identity or power of attorney if someone else is authorized to take it.

The researcher's analysis of the certificate handover activity has been carried out both by the Regent of Pelalawan and the Head of the Pelalawan Regency Land Office in 2022, both collectively at the Astaka football field, Bunut Village and at each Village Office. Based on Edward II's Theory, the Bureaucratic Structure Variable has been well implemented by the Land Office and also by the Pelalawan Regency Government, because it is easier for the community to receive certificates directly without having to come to the Land Office.

## Factors Inhibiting the Implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration Policy (PTSL) in Bunut District

The implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) for the 2021 budget year in Bunut District was carried out in 8 (eight) village/sub-district location determinations, namely: Bagan Laguh Village, Balam Merah Village, Bunut Village, Lubuk Mandian Gajah Village, Lubuk Mas Village, Merbau Village, Petani Village and Sungai Buluh. The Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) activity in Bunut District is a continuation of the PTSL PM activity in the previous budget year, the measurement and mapping of which had been carried out by a third party, namely KJSKB Maskur, then in 2021 it was followed up with the SHAT PTSL PM activity, namely the activity of collecting documents by the legal task force to determine the SHAT cluster, either in the form of K1 (Certificate), K3.1 or K3.3. Based on the data, it can be concluded that the Target Number of SHAT PTSL PM Activity Fields in Bunut District is 7,963 fields or an area of 56,006,940 M² for measurable fields into K1 cluster (certificates) of 3,633 or an area of 21,123,172 M² and for measurable fields without HAT of 4,330 fields or an area of 34,883,768 M², while for measurable fields without HAT based on Table IV.4 above are divided into 2 (two) clusters, namely:

a. Cluster K3.1 of 3,386 fields

#### b. Cluster K3.3 of 944 fields

From the analysis above, it can be concluded that the results of the SHAT PTSL PM research activities in Bunut District can be measured and mapped as many as 7,963 fields, but only around 45.62% or 3,633 fields covering an area of 21,123,172 M<sup>2</sup> are Cluster K1 (Certificate) while the remaining around 54.32% or 4,330 fields covering an area of 34,883,768 M<sup>2</sup> are measurable fields without HAT. The obstacles encountered by researchers when conducting field research on SHAT PTSL PM activities in Bunut District include:

- a. Imposition of BPHTB Tax and/or PPh
- b. The land plot is included in the PPIPIB area
- c. The Land Plot is Included in the Forest Area
- d. Land Owner's Whereabouts Unknown
- e. Financing of Complete Systematic Land Registration Preparation Activities in Pelalawan Regency
- f. The Number of Officers from the Pelalawan District Land Office is Minimal
- g. Lack of Community Enthusiasm in Attending PTSL Socialization/Counseling Activities

# Implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration Policy Based on Edward III's Theory

#### a. Communication

According to George C. Edwardi (in Agustino, 2008:150) argues that the first variable that influences the success of a policy implementation is communication. In the context of this study, communication is used to ensure the implementation of the complete systematic land registration policy (PTSL) in Pelalawan Regency can run effectively. Communication in policy implementation includes several important dimensions, namely information transformation (transmission), information clarity (clarity), and information consistency (consistency).

## b. Disposisition

According to Edward III in Winarno (2012:197), the tendency of policy implementers is the third factor that has important consequences for the effectiveness of policy implementation. The disposition or attitude of policy implementers is an important element in the approach to implementing public policy. In order for the implementation of a policy to be effective, implementers not only need to know what to do, but also have the ability to implement it, so that this can be realized in practice. The Pelalawan Regency Land Office in carrying out the disposition of the Implementation of the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPNI No.6i Year 2018 is by establishing an Adjudication Committee, one of

which is the SHAT PTSL PM Adjudication Committee in Bunut District which is formed with members according to their duties and functions and has the ability to complete PTSL activities. The Head of Adjudication in supporting the implementation of the PTSL policy must often coordinate intensively with all its members so that the desired policy can be understood together, in addition, adjudication members must also implement the implementation of the policy on target and completed on time.

#### c. Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucratic structure plays an important role in significantly influencing policy implementation. Aspects of this bureaucratic structure include two things, namely the mechanism and the bureaucratic structure itself.

- 1) The first aspect is the mechanism. In implementing the policy, a Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) has usually been prepared. This SOP functions as a guide for each implementer so that their actions do not deviate from the goals and objectives of the policy that have been set., The Adjudication Committee uses the complete systematic land registration technical instructions Number 1 / Juknis-100.Hk.02.01 / 2021 dated January 4, 2021 in carrying out its function of implementing the SHAT PTSL PM activity mechanism in Bunut District. The issuance of certificates is in accordance with the Standard Operating Procedures (SOP), starting from the planning process, determining the location, preparation, formation and determination of the Adjudication Committee, counseling, collection of physical and legal data, research of legal data to prove rights, announcement of physical data and legal data of the land area and its ratification for 14 calendar days until the issuance of the Certificate.
- 2) The second aspect is the bureaucratic structure. A bureaucratic structure that is too long and not integrated tends to weaken supervision and results in a convoluted and complex bureaucratic process, which can ultimately make the organization's operations rigid. The implementation of SHAT PTSL PM in Bunut District is different from the implementation of Certification through Routine activities at the Land Office both in terms of requirements, time period or costs.

#### d. Resource

Resources are a crucial factor to ensure that policies can be implemented properly, so that quality human resources (HR) and adequate facilities or infrastructure are needed in their implementation. These resources are divided into two categories, namely human resources (staff) and non-human resources (facilities or infrastructure).

1) Human Resources (staff)

Without the help of adequate human resources, both in terms of quantity and quality, policy implementation will fail. While quantity refers to how many human resources are available and whether they are sufficient to reach all target groups, quality refers to the ability, commitment, professionalism, and competence of human resources in their respective disciplines. The implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) in Pelalawan Regency has staff in accordance with their abilities to support PTSL activities by forming an Adjudication Team which is a combination of all Sections in the office which is formed into the Adjudication Committee Team, Physical Task Force, Legal Task Force and Administrative Task Force. For the implementation of iPTSL in Bunut District, a Team 5 SHAT PTSL PM Adjudication was formed to follow up on the results of measurements and mapping from third parties KJSKB Maskur et al. In the implementation of PTSL activities in Bunut District, human resources are still inadequate in terms of quantity, because starting from the socialization stage to implementation in 8 (eight) villages/sub-districts, it was carried out in 1 PTSL Adjudication team. Meanwhile, the number of land fields to be achieved is 7263 fields.

## 2) Non-Human Resources (Facilities and Infrastructure)

Facilities and infrastructure are important factors in implementing policies or programs. These facilities can include offices, tools or equipment, and vehicles. Procurement of adequate facilities, such as buildings, land, and office equipment, will support the successful implementation of a program or policy. Facilities and infrastructure aim to achieve the expected results according to plan. In the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) program in Bunut District, the aspects of facilities and infrastructure and the availability of supporting facilities such as technical equipment and measuring instruments are quite adequate, where the implementation has used a computerized system known as Computerized Land Activities (KKP).

#### 5. CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

#### Conclusion

Based on the Research Results on the Implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration Policy (Study in Bunut District, Pelalawan Regency), the researcher can conclude the following:

1. Implementation of Complete Systematic Land Registration Activities by Team V

Adjudication SHAT PTSL PM in Bunut District has been in accordance with the Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/Head of BPN No. 6 of 2018 concerning PTSL and technical instructions for complete systematic land registration Number 1/Juknis-100.Hk.02.01/2021 dated January 4, 2021, starting from the planning process, Location Determination, Preparation, Formation and Determination of the Adjudication Committee, Counseling, Collection of physical and legal data, Research of legal data for Proof of Rights, Announcement of Physical Data and Legal Data of the land area and its ratification for 14 calendar days until the issuance of the Certificate.

- 2. There are obstacles in the implementation of SHAT PTSL PM activities in Bunut District, namely:
  - a. Lack of human resources at the Land Office, so that the 5 SHAT PTSL PM team is responsible for 8 (eight) villages in Bunut District with a target of 7653 plots.
  - b. Lack of enthusiasm from the community in Bunut District due to the imposition of BPHTB owed.
  - c. There are plots of land that are included or intersect with the PIPPIB area so that they cannot be certified.
  - d. There are plots of community land whose land is partly intersects with the Forest area and the community is reluctant for their land to be cut for part of it to be certified so that it cannot become a K1 cluster (Certificate).
  - e. Landowners who are not present or cannot be contacted to fulfill the requirements as cluster K1 (Certificate)
  - f. Landowners who want their land measured but do not want to be given their rights in the form of a certificate because they do not need it because they have lived or worked there since they were small.

#### Suggestion

Based on the conclusions obtained from the above research, the following suggestions are made:

## For the Regional Government of Pelalawan Regency:

- a. The Pelalawan Regency Government to help socialize the importance of land title certificates to the Pelalawan Regency community through direct counseling to villages and to help disseminate information on PTSL activities through print and electronic media from the Pelalawan Regency Government.
- b. The Pelalawan Regency Government to help the community by creating Regional Regulations related to reducing the imposition of BPHTB or even zero for people whose

- land is certified through the Complete Systematic Registration (PTSL) program.
- c. The regional government is expected to allocate the APBD budget to provide honorariums to the PTSL driving team in the village so that the community does not need to bear the operational costs of the village.
- d. The Pelalawan Regency Government is expected to help the community by creating Regional Regulations related to reducing the imposition of BPHTB or even zero for people whose land is certified through the Complete Systematic Registration (PTSL) program.
- e. For land areas that intersect with forest areas or PPIPIB areas, the Pelalawan Regency Government together with the Pelalawan Regency Land Office should continue to coordinate with the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (KLHK) in Jakarta to be able to release residential areas or community cultivation that are still trapped in forest areas or PPIPIB.
- f. The Pelalawan Regency Government and the Pelalawan Regency Land Office should be able to collaborate so that the results of the identification of land objects in the form of land area maps can be used as a database or to update the determination of NJOB in the calculation of SPPT PBB.

## For Village/Sub-district Governments in Pelalawan Regency

- a. Village/Sub-district Governments must be able to record and recapitulate land plots owned by their citizens that are not yet certified to be proposed to the Land Office through the complete systematic land registration (PTSL) activity in the following year.
- b. Village/Sub-district Governments must be able to record and recapitulate land plots owned by their citizens, both those that are not yet certified and those that are certified but are included in the Forest Area or PIPPIB Area to be proposed for release to the Ministry of Environment and Forestry through the Regional Government.
- c. Village/Sub-district Governments must be able to record and recapitulate land plots owned by their citizens that are not yet certified but have been measured the previous year through the PTSL activity (K3.1), so that the next process can be followed up until they become Certificates by registering independently with the Land Office at a PNBP fee.

#### 6. REFERENCES

- Aji Pratama Putra, Sarjita, & Abdul Haris Farid. (2018). Peraturan desa sebagai instrumen pendukung pelaksanaan pendaftaran tanah sistematis lengkap.
- Ali, F. (2013). Teori dan konsep administrasi: Dari pemikiran paradigmatik menuju redefinisi.

- Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Andrianto, W. (2007). Manajemen publik: Konsep, aplikasi, dan implementasinya dalam pelaksanaan otonomi daerah. Bandung: Mandar Maju.
- Andry, H. (2015). Perilaku dan etika administrasi publik. Pekanbaru: Marpoyan Tujuh.
- Anonim. (1997). Kamus besar bahasa Indonesia. Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Bagus Hapsoro Mufti. (2018). Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Agraria dan Tata Ruang/Kepala Badan Pertanahan Nasional Nomor 12 Tahun 2017 tentang Pendaftaran Tanah Sistematis Lengkap (PTSL) di Desa Banjaroyo, Kecamatan Kalibawang, Kabupaten Kulon Progo. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Hukum, 26*(4).
- Creswell, J. W. (2010). Research design: Pendekatan kualitatif, kuantitatif, dan mixed. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Eko, W. S. (2015). *Manajemen pengembangan sumber daya manusia*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Gie, T. L. (2009). Administrasi perkantoran modern. Yogyakarta: Liberty.
- Gusti Ayu Ratih Damayanti. (2018). Pelaksanaan pendaftaran tanah sistematis lengkap di Kabupaten Lombok Utara (Analisis pembentukan Peraturan Bupati Nomor 34 Tahun 2017). *Jurnalius Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan*, 6(3), Des.
- Hartanti, D. D. N. (2010). Development of systematic land registration law implementation complete (PTSL) and influence on conduct of land-based value fairness dignified in Kendal Regency, Central Java. *Jurnal Ilmiah Fakultas Hukum, 1*, 1-358.
- Hasibuan, M. S. P. (2014). Manajemen: Dasar pengertian dan masalah. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Kusnadi, A., dkk. (2001). Penelitian tentang efektivitas peraturan perundang-undangan larangan tanah absentee. Jakarta: Badan Pembinaan Hukum Nasional, Departemen Kehakiman dan Hak Asasi Manusia Republik Indonesia.
- Moleong, L. J. (2012). Metodologi penelitian kualitatif. Bandung: PT Remaja.
- Pasolong, H. (2020). Metode penelitian administrasi publik. Bandung: ALFABETA.
- Prabowo, A., Aspan, H., Wahyuni, E. S., & Lestari, I. (2024). Anteseden shopping emotion konsumen dalam berbelanja brand fashion Uniqlo. *Management Studies and Business Journal (PRODUCTIVITY)*, 1(5), 826-834.
- Prabowo, A., Pohan, Y. A., Adam, A. A., Aulanda, N. F., & Roni, S. (2024). Transformasi era digitalisasi dalam membentuk jiwa leadership pada Gen-Z dan Millenial. *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Hasil Kegiatan Kolaborasi Pengabdian Masyarakat, 2*(2), 01-12.
- Prabowo, A., Wahyuni, E. S., Bakti, S., Sari, P. B., & Rossanty, Y. (2022). Does raising environmental awareness and creating pro-environmental attitudes drive the intention to revisit among visitors?. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute*-

- *Journal (BIRCI-Journal), 5*(3).
- R. Anggriani, G. Asmara. (2019). Implementasi keputusan bersama tiga menteri tentang pembiayaan persiapan pendaftaran tanah sistematis lengkap di Kabupaten Dompu. *Jurnal Education and Development*, 7(2), 288.
- Sadili Samsudin. (2005). Manajemen sumber daya manusia. Bandung: Pustaka Setia.
- Saleh, M. (2021). Komunikasi pelayanan publik Malang. PT. Cita Intrans Selaras.
- Sheila Pratiwi. (2019). Efektivitas pelaksanaan program pendaftaran tanah sistematis lengkap (PTSL) dalam rangka pemberian sertipikat gratis di Kecamatan Medan Marelan Kota Medan. *Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 15(6), 2021.
- Soewarno. (2002). Pengantar studi ilmu administrasi dan manajemen. Jakarta: Haji Masagung.
- Sondang P. (2008). Filsafat administrasi. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
- Suandi, I. W. (2010). Eksistensi kebijakan publik dan hukum dalam penyelenggaraan pemerintahan daerah. *Jurnal Ilmiah Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, 1*(1).
- Suharno. (2009). Dasar-dasar kebijakan publik. Yogyakarta: UNY Press.
- Syafri, W. (2012). Studi tentang administrasi publik. Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga.
- Wahyuni, E., Fachrudin, K., & Silalahi, A. (2019). An empirical study on women's financial behavior: Case study of female postgraduate students in Medan, Indonesia. *International Journal of Research Culture Society*, 3(11), 155-159.
- Winarno, B. (2007). Kebijakan publik teori dan proses. Jakarta: Media Pressindo.
- Yani, M. (2012). Manajemen SDM. Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Media.